

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF MINNESOTA**

---

Skky, Inc.,

Case No.: 13-2086 (PJS/JJG)

Plaintiff,

vs.

Manwin USA, Inc., and Manwin Holding, s.a.r.l,

Defendants.

---

Skky, Inc.,

Case No.: 13-2089 (PJS/JJG)

Plaintiff,

vs.

Playboy Enterprises, Inc.,

Defendant.

---

Skky, Inc.,

Case No.: 13-2087 (PJS/JJG)

Plaintiff,

vs.

Vivid Entertainment, LLC,

Defendant.

---

**DECLARATION OF TAMANY VINSON IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS  
MANWIN'S, PLAYBOY'S AND VIVID'S RESPONSE IN  
OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFF SKKY'S MOTION TO COMPEL**

I, Tamany Vinson Bentz, declare as follows:

1. I am an attorney with Venable LLP and counsel of record for Playboy Enterprises, Inc. (“Playboy”), Manwin USA, Inc. and Manwin Holdings, s.a.r.l (“Manwin”), and Vivid Entertainment, LLC (“Vivid”), (collectively “Defendants”).

2. I submit this Declaration in support of Defendants’ Response in Opposition to Skky’s Motion to Compel.

3. Attached as Exhibit 1 is a true and correct copy of the December 18, 2013, email from Ryan M. Schultz to Todd M. Noshier.

4. Attached as Exhibit 2 is a true and correct copy of the January 31, 2014, email from Todd M. Noshier to Ryan M. Schultz and Ronald J. Schutz with two attachments: a letter from Todd M. Noshier to Ryan Schultz and a proposed stipulation and order.

5. Attached as Exhibit 3 is a true and correct copy of the February 5, 2014, email from Ryan M. Schultz to Todd M. Noshier and Ronald J. Schutz with two attachments: a stipulation and proposed order.

6. Attached as Exhibit 4 is a true and correct copy of the email from Ryan M. Schultz to Todd M. Noshier and Ronald J. Schutz with two attachments: a letter from Ryan M. Schultz to Todd Noshier and Timothy Heverin and a proposed stipulation.

7. Attached as Exhibit 5 is a true and correct copy of the January 30, 2014, email from Todd M. Noshier to Ryan M. Schultz and Ronald J. Schutz. The attachments are not included in the exhibit because they are not related to Skky’s motion to compel.

8. Attached as Exhibit 6 is a true and correct copy of the February 5, 2014, letter from Todd M. Noshier to Ryan Schultz.

9. Attached as Exhibit 7 is a true and correct copy of the February 7, 2014, email from Ryan M. Schultz to Todd M. Noshier and Ronald J. Schutz.

10. On February 26, 2014, I participated in a telephone conference with Ryan Schultz concerning Vivid's responses to Skky's written discovery requests. During the telephone conference, I explained that Vivid uses third parties to operate its websites and those third parties have almost all of the documents Skky is requesting. In an effort to move discovery forward, I offered to walk through the requests for production and tell Mr. Schultz specifically what documents Vivid had and discuss what Vivid expected to be in the possession of third party vendors. Mr. Schutz indicated that he did not want to go through the requests.

11. On March 6, 2014, I caused a copy of Vivid's First Amended Responses to Skky's First Set of Interrogatories to be served on Skky's counsel. A true and correct copy of those responses is attached as Exhibit 8.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct, and that this declaration was executed this 11th day of March, 2014, in Los Angeles, California.

s/ Tamany Vinson Bentz  
Tamany Vinson Bentz